

# The Classical Bulletin

Published monthly from November through April by the Department of Classical Languages at Saint Louis University, Saint Louis 8, Missouri. Subscription price: \$2.00 a year. Entered as second-class matter at the Saint Louis, Missouri, Post-Office under the Act of March 3, 1879.

VOLUME 32

NOVEMBER 1955

NUMBER 1

## Joint Classical Conference at Oxford

The Joint Classical Conference, organized in Great Britain in 1942 by the Hellenic and Roman Societies, the Classical Association, and the British Schools at Athens and Rome, has been held triennially, alternately at Cambridge and Oxford, but because of the Madvig Commemoration at Copenhagen in the summer of 1954 (see my report in *CJ* 50 [1954] 109-114) it was postponed to August 4-11, 1955. The program, in contrast to more than fifty papers at Copenhagen, consisted of only seventeen papers (all except Parke's more than one hour long), with intervals of forty-five minutes to several hours for coffee and informal discussion and relaxation or visits to the colleges, press, and libraries, and excursions to King Alfred's County (and the White Horse) and especially to the well preserved and interesting Roman Villa and Museum at Chedworth. There were receptions at the Ashmolean Museum and at Saint John's, and many private dinners and luncheons.

The subjects ranged from the Hittites and Homer to darkest modern London, literary, historical, papyrological, archaeological (no epigraphical or glyptic or numismatic papers), philosophical, and mathematical. The classics presented a united front and were able to combat the frontiers of darkness and ignorance. There certainly was no British insularity. More than 415 were registered, including such distinguished foreign scholars as Dijksterhuis, Düring, Hourgon, Leumann, Riis, Strassburger, Tibletti, and several from Israel, Cyprus, Egypt, Australia, and Bagnani and Thomson of Toronto. The United States was poorly represented, only by Combellack, Shero, and myself. Laura Voelkel Summer of Mary Washington College, Van Buren from Rome, Immerwahr of Yale, Vermoule of Bryn Mawr, Miss Harrison from Athens (on her way to Columbia), Miss Davison (on her way to the University of Vermont) also attended some of the sessions. I sat at all of them and stood at all social events.

### Papers by Beazley and McDonald

I can say that American scholars missed much, as the papers contributed original material and were clearly and intelligibly presented without a loud speaker (rarely do scholars speak so loudly and so audibly). No one dropped his voice and there was much genuine oratory. All papers showed sound sense, which is often lacking at scholarly sessions.

### In this issue . . .

- Joint Classical Conference at Oxford  
David Moore Robinson 1
- Streamlining Latin Case Syntax  
D. Herbert Abel 5
- American Education Week and Classicists  
Editorial 6
- Verse: Pindar on Music's Power  
Richard M. Mackowski, S.J. 7
- Breviora*: Deaths among Classicists, I (page 9).  
Meetings of Classical Interest, I (page 9). Pliny,  
*Epistulae* 10.89 (Selatie E. Stout, page 10). Contin-  
nuance of Woodrow Wilson Fellowship Program  
(page 10). Certamen Capitolinum VII (page 10).
- Book Reviews*: Stewart C. Easton, *The Heritage of  
the Past* (Clarence A. Herbst, page 11). C. A.  
Robinson, *The History of Alexander the Great*,  
Vol. 1 (Alexander G. McKay, page 11). Revilo  
Pendleton Oliver, ed., *Niccolò Perotti's Version of  
the Enchiridion of Epictetus* (Walter J. Ong, S.J.,  
page 11). Mary E. White, ed., *Studies in Honour  
of Gilbert Norwood* (M. Joseph Costelloe, S.J.,  
page 12).
- Materials Available through the Office of THE  
CLASSICAL BULLETIN 12

The conference was held at Rhodes House on August 4, where at the entrance the carved inscription says in good Greek fifth century letters *μηδεις καπνοφόρος εἰσῖτο* (let no smoker enter), but some (including cultivated laymen and a former superintendent of schools in Nigeria) not acquainted with geometry (as says the original of Plato, used over the entrance to the Harvard classical library) were allowed to pass. The only paper of the evening was a brilliant one by Sir Jonh Beazley on "The Vase Painter Makron," in excellent English and with eternal stories about Helen (not modernized and bowlderized as in a "Tiger at the Gates," which was playing in London). The detective work of the master magician in piecing together fragments from all four corners of the globe (one piece in Holland said to come from the Acropolis fits one found in Italy and now in Naples) greatly amused the audience of over three hundred.

On August 5, Professor A. H. McDonald of Cambridge well analysed Livy's style, showing how popular his periodic composition was, compared with Cicero's and Caesar's. He seemed to me, who had just spent fifteen days at Abano, Livy's birthplace near Padova with a good statue of Livy, and had sat in the hot caves where Livy sat, that more attention should be given to Livy's *Patavinitas*. But Mr. Mc-

Donald compared with typewritten texts before us Livy's accounts of certain events with those of Scipio (especially 1.7.4 and 7), Herodotus, Dionysius of Halicarnassus, and others. Livy's stories of Geryon's cattle and the cult of Hermes were taken as good examples. There is more clarity and completeness in Livy, who used the annalists and developed more freedom and introduced poetic and periodic structures. Mr. McDonald took objection to Konrad Gries's dissertation on "Constancy in Livy's Latinity" and his article on "Livy's Use of Dramatic Speech" (in *AJP* 70 [1949] 118-141). He certainly showed Livy's change of style and development of an annalistic periodic form of writing with new words, new tricks of style and constructions. He used non-Roman mannerisms, which gave an exotic or foreign flavor to his Latin, quite pleasing to the xenophile Romans.

#### *Dijksterhuis, Dover, and Turner*

The lecture of Professor Dijksterhuis of Utrecht, who is just publishing a book on Archimedes, on "Mathematics in Greek Science," definitely demonstrated Greek mathematics as the very core of modern science. The hypothetical-mathematical method (a better phrase than mathematical-empirical) was first used by Pythagoras. Pythagoras has been neglected, but mention might be made of the official change of *Tigani* in Samos to *Pythagorion*, in honor of the 2500th anniversary of the first school of philosophy. The recent congress there suggested, as did Mr. Dijksterhuis, the regeneration of humanity through an educational system combining philosophy, religion, and science. Plato, Archimedes, Eudoxus, Hephaestion, and the Ptolemies of Alexandria, the greatest centre of culture, were the first to understand the uniform circulation of the universe, the equilibrium of the planets, and the idea of concentric circles.

On August 6, Professor Dover of Saint Andrews discussed the "Political Aspects of Aeschylus' Eumenides." Many passages are surely patriotic, such as Orestes' invocation of Athena, Athena's speech, and the promise twice of Argive alliance, but we should interpret Aeschylus in view of his audience, more interested in dramatic technique and philosophy than in politics, such as his invention of the trial of Orestes before the Areopagus, his idea of the new deal, his emphasis on justice (thirty cases of *νόμος*, "no justice without fear"), on no civil war, and his prayer against *στάσις* and for peace. The tone is that of the assurance of honor, glory, and peace. There is no allegory, no allusion to the Alcmaeonidae and to Pericles. The gods are real, though Aeschylus did change, correct, and supplement tradition.

Professor Turner of London (a pupil of Sir Idris Bell, who introduced him) spoke on "Scribes and

Scholars of Oxyrhynchus." He showed, with many slides of papyri (including a part of Aeschines' *De Falsa Legatione*), that the scribes were serious scholars (I have a papyrus part of the *Contra Ctesiphontem* which may belong to the same scribe). Their chirography is easily detected and fragments can be reassigned to definite scribes. Scholarly scribes, first class classicists, poets as well as athletes, were exempt from income taxes. Scribes made for professors in the Museum of Alexandria copies of Homer, Sappho, Satyrus, the biographer of Euripides, Theon, Valerius Pollio, the orators, and chronicles of historical events such as the killing of the male inhabitants of Mitylene and an account of Cleon in 427 B. C., different from that in Thucydides, and even the indictment of Euripides for writing the *Hercules Furens*. One scribe scribbled for twelve different scholars.

#### *John Bradford*

John Bradford, whose book on *Aerial Photography* is in press, was a substitute, deputized for the paper on "Lucretius" by Wells, who was ill. He showed slides and exhibited many aerial plans of Verona (the Adige river has changed its course), of Padua (two systems of centuriation), of Paestum with the Olynthian grid system of streets, of Etruscan cemeteries at Monte Abelone, Tarquinia (and Colle Pantano), Civitavecchia, Cerveteri with hundreds of tombs not previously located, of Valence in the Rhone valley (first example of centuriation in Gaul), of Aquileia, Pola, Salona, and Zara (both good examples of units two hundred *iugera centuriae*); also of Split and of the island Hvar, colonised by the Greeks (squares of six hundred Roman feet) and called Pharos by the Romans, also of towns in Apulia and Tunis, and so on (see *Antiquity* 21 [1947] 74-83, 197-204). This is entirely new material, important for the history of city-planning, but the relations to such Hippodamian Greek plans as that of Olynthus to the Greek landscaping and field systems on the lower slopes of Mount Hymettus, and to Olynthus (Vols. VIII and XII) cannot be neglected in one's saying that the Romans were the first to use the gridded ground plan.

#### *Sherwin-White, Parke, and Beare*

On August 8, Sherwin-White of Oxford, introduced by Momigliano, no great authority on violence, talked on "Violence in Roman Politics," giving a new interpretation of Marius down to 100 B.C., of Pompey, Crassus, Metellus, and Saturninus. There were no armies of importance even in 70 B.C. The leaders had little taste for violence and obeyed the law. Sulla and Octavius were exceptions. Professor Parke of Dublin, introduced by Guthrie, spoke on "Delphi Prophets, Pythias, and Sibyls," his book on the subject, now in press. The Pythia was neither a

normal person nor a maenad, nor the bride of Apollo; Cassandra is not his mouthpiece, nor a mythical reflex of the Pythia. She is a local peculiarity of Delphi, derived from the earth goddess who was at Delphi before Apollo, Ge and Themis, as Aeschylus says. After 750 B.C., prophecy by a woman was reintroduced. The Cumaean Sibyl owes little to the Pythia and is of Asiatic origin.

In the afternoon, at 5:30 p.m., Professor Beare, Bristol, who comes to America in the place of Miss Toynbee as Norton lecturer for the Archaeological Institute of America, author of *The Roman Stage*, presented with excellent delivery a long paper on "Origins of Latin Rhythmic Verse."

### "The London Mithraeum"

The evening (not on the program) was given over to Mrs. Audrey Williams (introduced by Miss Toynbee, sister of the great historian, who started also as a classicist). She lectured with many slides on "The London Mithraeum" found recently on the banks of the Wallbrook. She described every detail lucidly and in such a fascinating fashion that she did not lose for a moment the close attention of her large audience. She traced the history of the mithraeum from the second century and suggested that it was built for London's business men and not for the military, thus avoiding the criticism that it differs radically from other mithraea so frequented by soldiers. It is more like a church or basilica with apse, with columns inside, and no long continuous raised sides for communicants to recline on and so receive the bloody aspersion, no basin from which to drink the blood of the bull, no evidence of the Mithraic sacrament. Mrs. Williams drew attention to three pieces of statuary found on the site seventy years ago but not properly recorded. They represent a river god and a head more like that of Serapis or the Sun than Mithras. A hand with knife would seem to point to a relief of Mithras slaying the bull, but there is no bull.

I am not yet convinced that it is a mithraeum as publicized in the American and British Press. Women were not admitted to mithraea, and Mithras would have resented representation by a woman. It may be a temple of Serapis or the Sun. One inscription seems to say *invicto Soli*. In any case, though many stones, by no means all, have been removed and the structure is to be rebuilt in another site with a model, though according to the *London Times* no British archaeologists have dared to suggest further excavations or that the Mansion House should be turned over to the London Excavation Council, and though no one has objected to the modern structure being built over the site, I should like, as an archaeologist, to say that archaeology should not destroy but preserve ancient monuments, as is done in Italy,

where the "Servian Wall" still stands in the modern railroad station.

Anent British criticism of the "bad methods" of others, note in the review (*JHS* 75 [1955] 186) of the late Mrs. Hill's *The Ancient City of Athens* by Hugh Plommer: "it is unfortunate that this book was published in England and not in the U. S. A." However, the reviewer evidently does not realize that Mrs. Hill (Ida Thallon) was born and bred in Great Britain, of British parents, inherited a British estate, spent much time in England, and purposely published in England, in honor of her teacher, Jane Harrison.

We shall never know now when and how the mithraeum met its end, what the competition was with Christianity, how the colossal hand and arm came there, if they really did, whether there were other mithraea, whether there was a great forecourt. Perhaps some scientific archaeologist will some day freeze the earth, as is done in Rome, and dig under the modern building and so extract a few inscriptions to settle the important question which should never have been buried alive.

### Murray and Page

On August 9, Professor Gilbert Murray (now ninety years old), who was present at almost all sessions and was especially kind to me, remembering our acquaintance when he was in America, presided with much charm. He is a most lovable human and humane poetic character, a personification of the Greek spirit. He remarked that about 1889 his friend H. A. L. Fisher had deserted ancient history for modern because there was nothing new in the former. The next year there emerged from poetic legend the Minoan tablets, which are revolutionizing our knowledge of the Greeks and the Hittites. Professor Page applied the Greek quality of common sense, for which Murray pleaded, in his paper with the misleading title of "Homer and the Hittites." There was little of Homer, but the speaker demolished in a lively and entertaining review much learned theorizing about the connection of the Akhkhijawa with Mycenae. It was impossible, he said amid great laughter, to name any site for the first time; but an article in Beyces Sultan limited the possible position to southwestern Asia Minor. Mr. Page settled for Rhodes, an outpost of the historic Achaeans. He read an unpublished letter of the Great King of the Hittites in the thirteenth century B.C. to the King of Akhkhijawa, which with some twenty other documents showed that Mycenae was too far away and that an island was concerned (why not Crete or Samos?). Mr. Page believes in the historicity of Atreus, Eteocles, Alexander (Paris), and of the stories of Lesbos, Miletus, and the like. Though a brilliant lecturer, he was far from persuasive and his



theory will be demolished, especially the idea that the feudal Hittite kings carried through a press-button mobilization of all Anatolia and remained independent. Mr. Page is more persuasive when writing on Sappho or Alcaeus.

### *Building Techniques and Concrete*

Mr. J. Ward Perkins, Director of the British School at Rome, just returned from Cyrene and Istanbul, spoke with slides on "Building Techniques and Architectural Methods in Rome and Constantinople." He provided a concrete curtain between Rome and Byzantium. Architecture, as the art of ordering internal spaces rather than external masses, was invented in Rome between the times of Nero and Hadrian. It was based on the use of concrete, for the great vaults were upheld by their monolithic substance and not by a system of stress and counter-stress. This is different from the Gothic system but rare outside of Rome, since the provincial builders did not produce as good concrete and the brick and stone facings served as structural supports. This was the technique used at Constantinople. Saint Sophia was a purely Roman conception but carried out with the provincial technique. The core of the typical East Roman wall was not concrete but rubble sustained by surface walls. The Byzantine builders were heirs of the East as of the classical tradition.

### *"Linear B" Script*

The evening was devoted, in the absence of Ventris in Chios, to a progress report by Chadwick on the Mycenaean *Linear B* script, which they had deciphered, a discovery as great for literature and history as the decipherment of the Rosetta stone, or of Hittite, or even the discovery of the atom bomb. Mr. Chadwick answered the sceptics and he demolished the ten points of Plato, the brilliant ephor of the model new museum in Crete where the Cnossus tablets are preserved. Chadwick had seen the new tablets—found by Blegen and Wace, but not those of Mylonas. In one of Blegen's tablets, the words are illustrated by vases with no legs, one, two, three, or four. In another new tablet, horses' heads help us interpret the inventories with pictures. Even Evans had thought of reading *polo* (πῶλος), the Greek for "foal." A new fragment gives both signs (Greek ἵππος, Latin *equus*) for horse, and *ono* for ὄνος, "ass" (which occurs only once in Homer).

Other fragments with pictures, as from Pylos, give lists of tables, chairs, and footstools with ivory panels decorated with a man, octopus, horse, and phoenix or griffin. Others give lists of weapons and trade armor (thus, θώραξ). Most important for economics and trade are the long lists of spices, condiments, and plants, including mint. It will not be long now before we shall have longer translations. Already the doubters are demolished. The history

of the Mycenaean and Homeric world becomes more clear. Perhaps even mint juleps are not modern but Mycenaean!

On August 10, Professor A. H. M. Jones, in his provocative paper on "The Unimportance of Trade and Industry in the Roman Empire," challenged the views of the deceased Rostovtzeff and Tenney Frank. While I was listening, I wished that my former fellow student and later colleague could have risen from his grave nearby to answer. What about Ostia's trade? What about Capua's monopolistic commerce in copper containers? What about Cyrene, Hierapolis, Ephesus, and Alexandria? How about pepper, spices, and jewelry, and works of art? Mr. Jones's evidence was mostly very late and would not apply to the early principate of Rome, which was said to have no comparable position with that of a modern state. Rome's economy was based on agriculture, the population mostly rural, the peasants not merchants and living in self-contained communities, with civic craftsmen exempt from income taxes. Even in the great cities luxury goods were produced only for export.

### *Jones on Roman Imperial Trade*

The wealthy, who were outnumbered by the slaves and freshmen, men of family, *decuriones*, members of guilds, were forbidden to trade, but sometimes they did so through agents. It was not considered respectable to be a business man. Traders rarely ran for political office.

State revenue was drawn from the country, though the taxes on towns were heavier. In 500 A.D. the revenue from Edessa in Syria was about a hundred dollars in gold a year, whereas that from the farming area of Heracleopolis in Egypt was twenty-three times as much. Saint Augustine's friend Melania had an annual income of about \$4700 in gold when she renounced her revenue for religion. However, one of the leading merchants of Alexandria had over \$5100 in gold a year, and the government had to give subsidies to oil merchants and ship owners. Transport of bulky goods was possible only from points near the sea. Inland towns relied on local crops and could not dispose of their surplus products. The cost of land transport of wheat doubled for every three hundred miles. A peck of wheat, on the other hand, could be shipped for sixteen *denarii* 1250 miles from Alexandria to Rome. Overland transport was twenty-five times as much for the same distance. Soldiers got eight *solidi* a year from taxes on agriculture, but only one from urban taxes. Weavers, potters, clothiers, where conditions were good for a wide market, produced fabrics of different grades with different prices. They sold much, though the purchasing power of money was poor.

(Continued on page 7)

### Streamlining Latin Case Syntax

You have heard about not being able to see the woods for the trees. You probably have had the experience of sitting under the Big Top, watching the multiple twirls and spins of multiple acts in the three-ring circus, acts so similar yet so varied that it took thought to reduce them to a single, unified impression. Perhaps you have listened to a band playing in the modern rhythm, and, in the cacophony of the brasses, you have not been able to identify the melody. Too many sounds in the blare of the trumpets, too many kaleidoscopic glimpses of glittering costumes, too many trees; the result: no melody, no single picture, no woods. Yet without this basic synthesis there is nothing. We know nothing of an entity unless we can define it; we must know its nature and its substance; we cannot define it by giving its component parts or by giving examples of it. We must know its genus and specific differences, the class of objects to which it belongs, and how it varies from others in that class.

In the functional study of the Latin syntax of the cases, there is often a too great emphasis on the particular usage, with little or no stress on the general concept underlying all such usages. There are Latin pupils who can pick out of a given sentence an example of a partitive genitive or an ablative with *utor*, and can give such words their proper label, because they have memorized an example or two from their Latin text, and somehow know that they have a partitive genitive or an ablative with *utor*. But they cannot tell precisely what such terms mean, and even worse, cannot give any definition of the genitive or ablative case.

#### Roman Consciousness of Grammar

You will surely agree with me that Caesar, on "that summer evening in his tent, That day he overcame the Nervii," did not say, while composing his communique for the S.P.Q.R.: "Now shall I use an ablative of accompaniment or an ablative of attendant circumstances?" Nor did Cicero, in writing against Verres, stop to ask: "Is this an ethical dative, or a dative of purpose, or mayhap a simple dative of possession that I am using here?" The idiom of the language, however, the usages, the norms of expression did demand that Caesar use an ablative and Cicero a dative.

If a man knows the various parts of an automobile, but does not know what an automobile is or what it is used for, his knowledge is rather fruitless. So with the Latin case syntax. Bennett's *Latin Grammar* lists (with exceptions omitted) at least 14 separate classes of accusatives, 14 of datives, 15 of genitives, and 21 of ablatives. Knowledge of such formal distinctions as that between the ablative of accompaniment and the ablative of attendant cir-

cumstances is pedantic and sterile, if the student does not realize that both are connected with the "with-function" of the ablative case. It was with these major functions of case, tense, and mood that Caesar and Cicero were concerned; they were expressing the essence of "accusativeness" or the essence of "subjunctivity." They used the indicative mood to express a fact, and the subjunctive mood for a non-fact; instinctively, they felt that "an anticipatory *dum*, *donec*, or *quoad* was followed by a subjunctive," because the clause was a non-factual statement: it had not yet happened. Such use grew from general principles, not from minute distinctions. I feel certain that Cicero never asked himself whether he was using a clause of characteristic, or a *qui* clause of purpose, or a *qui* clause of result.

#### "General Concepts" for the Cases

It seems clear to me that there are certain general concepts that are the substratum for all the various uses of the individual cases. Such general concepts embrace the terms: "limit," "concern" or "feeling," "source," "separation," "location," "accompaniment," and "means." These are seven concepts which serve as major designations of the various syntactical rules of the cases. To teach syntax functionally is our acknowledged aim, and there is no more efficient way to stress functional knowledge than that method which proceeds from the general to the particular. Such a method, that of emphasizing the general category, the basic substrate idea, the substantial essence of each case, and then requiring the student to explain how this basic idea is expressed in this particular instance, results in streamlining the Latin case syntax into a very few dogmatic rules, while allowing variety of interpretation, discussion, and decision by the student of the functional use of each form he meets. Let us examine now specific instances of case syntax and see how this application of the general category may be made. The nomenclature of specific grammatical uses is that appearing in Bennett's *Latin Grammar*.

#### Accusative and Dative Cases

In such streamlining, we define the accusative case as that inflectional form of a noun, pronoun, or adjective that denotes the "end" or "limit" of the action or motion expressed by the verb. This concept of "end" or "limit" is all that either we or our students need to know or express concerning the accusative case. Once we have impressed on our pupils the idea that the accusative case stands for "end" or "limit," we then require them to show how this category of "end" or "limit" fits the various accusative uses.

We do not ask them to label a word as a *Greek accusative*; we do not ask for a definition of a

(Continued on page 8)



# The Classical Bulletin

Published by the Department of Classical Languages  
at Saint Louis University

## EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

William Charles Korfmacher.....	Editor
M. Joseph Costelloe, S.J.....	Associate Editor
Chauncey Edgar Finch.....	Associate Editor
Marcus Anthony Haworth, S.J.....	Associate Editor
Francis Charles Hunleth, S.J.....	Associate Editor

Address: 3647 West Pine Boulevard, Saint Louis 8, Missouri  
Subscription: \$2.00 per year. Single copies: 40c. To members  
of the ACL, CAAS, CAMWS, CANE, and CAPS, \$1.60 per  
year, through the Office of the Secretary-Treasurer of each  
of these organizations.

Concerning subscriptions, renewals, books, pamphlets, adver-  
tising, and the like, please address the Editor. Concerning  
manuscripts for possible publication, address any member  
of the Committee.

Volume 32      November 1955      Number 1

## E D I T O R I A L

### American Education Week and Classicists

The President of the United States, in his pro-  
clamation urging the observance of American Edu-  
cation Week, November 6-12, 1955, includes an  
eloquent tribute to education as contributing "not  
only to the development of a fuller and more useful  
life for the individual citizen but also to the safe-  
guarding of the freedoms and ideals which we cher-  
ish as Americans." Later, he speaks of the seven-  
day observance "as a tribute to the challenging role  
American education is playing in building a stronger  
nation in today's world of nations."

To the classicist, somewhat disturbed at times by  
a seeming over-insistence in some educational the-  
ories on "education for society" to the apparent ex-  
clusion of "education for God" and "education for  
the individual," the expressed ideal of "the develop-  
ment of a fuller and more useful life for the individ-  
ual citizen" will come as a benison. For classical  
training is deeply concerned with the individual—  
not, to be sure, to the neglect of the individual's  
duties in other relationships, but in the sane convic-  
tion that the greater perfecting of the individual  
will mean a greater perfection in his service to God  
and country, to family, to society, to the world.

Classical training, and the spirit of the great  
classical tradition, assume always the importance  
and worth of the individual. The schools of Hellas  
and of Rome, looking to the formation of the finished  
orator, the capable rhetorician, the intelligent phi-  
losopher, could not proceed otherwise than by at-  
tempting to develop and nurture into flower the  
latent powers of the individual. When Cicero in the  
seventh chapter of the *Pro Archia* theorizes on the  
relative value of *natura* and *ratio*, "natural ability"

and "training," he is obviously not thinking of men  
in the mass. And when he speaks of the *natura  
eximia et illustris* to which is adjoined *ratio quaedam  
conformatioque doctrinae*—the "unusual and dis-  
tinguished natural ability" perfected by "a certain  
systematic and formative training"—it is this par-  
ticular man and that, and a third, whom he has in  
mind. And this combination of rare talent and or-  
derly training, he says, will result in *nescio quid  
praeclarum ac singulare*—"something (some one)  
outstanding and unique." But again, some one, not  
a mass of persons; much as if he were to say that it  
was worth Nature's effort to produce, and man's  
labors to develop, now and again, one outstanding  
human being.

Here is a single great answer from the classical  
tradition to the perplexities of current educational  
theory: the individual is inestimably important.  
Critics will be quick to query how such a concept can  
be evoked from ancient societies which legally re-  
garded slaves as mere chattels and trod under foot  
countless freed and free-born human beings who  
stood in the way of the drive for personal gain or  
pleasure, for community aggrandizement and the  
achievement of military supremacy. And the answer  
of course, must be that ancient theory thought of  
some individuals only, not of all, leaving it for Chris-  
tian teaching to instruct mankind in the innate  
worth of every human being, free or slave.

But, as far as natural philosophy could attain  
thereto, the roots of the value and potentialities of  
the individual are solidly and fruitfully grounded in  
the best thinking of Greece and Rome, and in the  
best postulates of Greek and Roman educational  
theorists. The American classicist of today may well  
take pride in this distinctive and mighty contribu-  
tion of the discipline to whose interpretation and  
teaching he is dedicated.

American Education Week may bring with it  
many reappraisals, many re-examinations, of what  
youth training is doing and yet hopes to do. With  
us, as classicists, rests the duty of making sure that  
the strong voice of ancient Greece and ancient Rome  
continues to be heard—proclaiming in words of  
matchless eloquence the unchanging worth of the  
individual man.

—W. C. K.

Proinde bonus etiamsi serviat, liber est; malus  
autem etiamsi regnet, servus est, nec unius hominis,  
sed quod est gravius, tot dominorum, quot vitiorum.  
—August. *Civ. D.* 4.3.

Horace, like all the poets of his time, conceived it  
to be the function of his art either to reproduce in  
Latin the masterpieces of Greek literature, or to  
adapt to the taste of his own age the old poets of his  
own land.—R. Y. Tyrrell.

### Pindar on Music's Power (Prelude to *Pythica* 1)

Sing, Golden Lyre, treasure shared by Apollo  
and the violet-crowned Muses;  
When, with your quivering strings, you intone  
the prelude of the chorus-leader,  
The dance-step is poised, awaiting the over-  
ture of delight;  
And the singing-chorus follows your lilting  
beat.  
You melt the spear-pointed thunderbolt of  
the undying fire;  
While upon the sceptre of Zeus, the eagle is  
fast asleep,  
Twin mighty pinions drooping; a cloudy mist,  
for eyelids' gentle keep,  
You pour upon the nodding crest of the  
monarch of the sky,  
Whose supple back undulates in rhythmic slumber,  
enchanted by the great tides of your song.  
Even violent Ares, whose heart is soothed in  
deep repose,  
Forsakes his harsh and pointed spear. The  
spell of your music lulls the senses  
Even of the gods, by the skill of Leto's son  
and the gracefully-robed Muses.  
But whatever Zeus holds in favor, on earth  
or on the writhing seas, is enchanted  
By your sweet Pierian strains; even five-score-  
headed Typhon shudders in terror, that  
Foeman of the gods, who lies in baneful Hades  
deep. Him the far-famed Cilician cave once  
Nursed; but now the salt-washed cliffs near  
Cumae and Sicily, too, weigh down upon his  
Shaggy chest. And a pillar of heaven now im-  
pales him, hoar-capped Aetna, guardian  
Of snows eternal,  
From whose inmost caves purifying fountains of  
unapproachable fire burst forth;  
And whose rivers pour down dismal torrents of  
smoke;  
While amid the gloom of night the scarlet flame  
with uproar loud and dire, rolls and hurls  
The rocks into the deep sea below. And that  
monstrous dragon, to those about a marvel  
To see, a wonder to hear, sends up these most  
awful flames of the Fire-God.  
Here is this monster, but now he is pinned  
down between Etna's woody heights  
And the plain below. His craggy couch tor-  
ments his outstretched back.  
To us, then, Father Zeus, grant us your favor;  
you grace this mountain with  
Your holy presence, this brow of a fruitful  
land, whose neighboring city, after Aetna  
Named and made glorious by its famous founder  
when at the Pythian Games, the herald,

Lifting up his cry, proclaimed its name for  
Hieron's great victory in the chariot race.

*Richard M. Mackowski, S.J.*

West Baden College,  
West Baden, Indiana

### Joint Classical Conference

(Continued from page 4)

But large production for wide distribution was rare. The trade in luxuries, such as wines and elegant tableware, was limited to a few areas. Trade on a large scale flourished only in such places as Rome, Lugdunum in Gaul (where trade was left to freedmen and foreigners), Alexandria (which controlled trade in glass and fabrics to Arabia and India and had a monopoly of papyri and perfumes), Palmyra (whose wealth was due to a levy on caravans passing through: see my text in Robinson-Hoyningen-Huene, *Baalbek-Palmyra* [New York 1946] 61-89).

### *Banti and Etruscology*

Professor Düring of Göteborg lectured on "Aristotle and Plato in the 350's," solving some problems and quoting a phrase which is hardly out of date: "The cosmic catastrophes which from time to time overwhelmed mankind save for a minute minority."

In the evening Miss Banti, professor of Etruscology at Florence, who spoke last summer at Copenhagen and has given courses at Columbia, delivered, in excellent English with an attractive accent, a lecture on "Art and Decoration in Etruscan Painting." Her tongue once slipped and she said "that could not have been painted in England." Amid great laughter she corrected "England" to "Greece." She showed mostly pictures of Tarquinia and demonstrated the difference between the Greeks and Etruscans, who loved birds and animals and landscapes more than the Greeks, who emphasized the human figure. She said that the Italians were trying to save from wrack and ruin and damage by water the beautiful paintings. She did not refer to the wonderful colored reproductions by Prentice Duell which will save them from complete oblivion. Miss Banti certainly has increased our admiration for the Etruscans, as have the new arrangement and lighting in the Museo di Villa Giulia in Rome and the magnificent Mostra Etrusca which I saw in Milan (now in Amsterdam). I think, however, the Etruscophiles go too far in believing to be Etruscan vases with Greek scenes and inscriptions (such as the Olto vase, transferred from Tarquinia to Rome), the "Pontic" amphorae, the "Caeretan" hydriae, the Paris vase. If Etruscan, they were made by Greeks who migrated to Etruria. No native could have been so hellenized even after study in Greece or under a Greek in Etruria.

### Snell and the "Isthmiaeae"

For August 11 the choicest wine was left. Last but not least was the fascinating Professor Bruno Snell of Hamburg, the great humanist who wrote *The Discovery of the Mind*, editor of Pindar, Bacchylides, and the *Homeric Lexicon*. We are not what our fathers were. Professor Snell belongs to what Vergil calls the *magnanimi heroes nati melioribus annis*. Though an unwilling guest of his Majesty during the war, he took a degree at Edinburgh, and he has lectured in America, discovering a fragment of Hesiod at Michigan.

This time he showed his great ability by completing a jigsaw puzzle drama, making a new arrangement and new jointures of the pieces of papyri of Aeschylus' *Isthmiaeae*. This is interesting, in view of the American excavations at the Isthmia founded by Sisyphus of Corinth, the subject of plays by Aeschylus, Sophocles, and Euripides. Snell drew fragments on the blackboard and gave each of us the Greek text of ninety-eight verses (see *Oxyrhynchus Papyri* no. 2250). Snell's work now places his satyr play of Aeschylus, whose satyric dramas, according to Paresamas 2.13.5, were the most popular in this kind of literature, on a higher literary level than Sophocles' *Ichneutae* or Euripides' *Cyclopes*.

The plot is clear. The bibulus satyrs thought that they would escape from the control of Silenus and exchange their poverty for a higher and more luxurious life. They would come as observers (*θεωγοί*, the other part of the double title) to see Silenus dance; they would bargain with Sisyphus to eliminate all other competitors by killing them or scaring them away by hanging up their masks. Sisyphus promised new toys (*ἀθύρματα νεόκτητα*), but these proved to be iron-tipped spears. They changed their costumes and tried to cultivate a better culture. But these new humorous technical inventions such as made Corinth famous (fire, lyre, and the like) were too much for the satyrs. They were too frightened to use them. They had a sudden change of mind and gladly returned to their former simple system of service to Silenus.

Professor Dodds closed the sessions with nicely expressed thanks to all. So ended one of the best classical conferences, which pushed back and definitely extended forward the frontiers of knowledge. It was pleasant to renew many old contracts and to make new ones. The classics are thriving in Europe more than in America. All are interested, "doctor, lawyer, merchant, chief." Three of our physicians—of Italy, Switzerland, France—said they owed their success to their study of Greek and Latin, especially Greek. Interested too are lawyer, merchant, executive, diplomat (British consul Baker at Syracuse has recently located the Greek ships sunk there in 413 B.C.). We should do more to teach the modern world

the practical wisdom of the ancient, which is badly needed to solve our not entirely new problems. The Oxford lectures, as was true of the Copenhagen ones, gave us much which seems incredible and impossible and many thoughts for the future. Greek, sir, is not like lace but like nylon. It is the fashion, at least in translation. A million Penguin *Odysseys* have been sold this last year, and 50,000 of the other twenty Greek and Latin *Penguins*. There may be little Latin and less Greek, but there is more reading of the classics (in translation) than ever before. Luckily, the *Penguins* are in plain and readable English, fairly accurate, a thing that is more than can be said for some reputedly "scholarly" translations. The classics are fresh, absorbing, interesting reading.

David Moore Robinson

University of Mississippi

### Streamlining Latin Case Syntax

(Continued from page 5)

Greek accusative. We give them *tremi artus*, ask them to see that *artus* is the limit of the *tremi*, that therefore his limbs, not his hands or head, are trembling, and that his trembling is limited and confined to his limbs. We give them *galeam induitur*, ask them to see that his dressing is limited by his helmet, with nothing said about his tunic or his sword. We give them *video hominem abire*, ask them to see that there are two limits to what I am seeing: a limit of person (a man) and a limit of thing (going away). Thus the difficult subject accusative with infinitive becomes a simple accusative of limit: "I see a man going away."

In like manner, we define the dative case as that inflectional form which denotes the person or thing concerned in the action of the verb; it expresses the idea of "concern" or "regard" or "interest"; it is therefore the case of "feeling" or "hurt." Thus we point out that *meus filius mortuus est* is just a cold statement of fact: "My son is dead"; whereas *mihi filius mortuus est* connotes feeling: it has the added meaning of "It's my son who's dead and it hurts!" Similarly, the dative with impersonals: *tibi parcat* becomes: "There is sparing, and you feel it!" The dative of separation: *honorem detraxerunt homini* becomes: "They took away his honor and the fellow feels it!" With the idea of "concern" the dative of possession's *mihi est liber* becomes "In my concern there is a book—and so it's my book."

### Genitive and Ablative Cases

The genitive case we would define as that inflectional form which denotes source or origin. The ablative would be that inflectional form which may have one of the four functions, corresponding to the four prepositions normally studied in the paradigm



of the declensions. These four are accompaniment (with), means (by), separation (from), and location (in).

Such concepts of the genitive and ablative allow us to explain simply, for example, the difference between the genitive of quality and ablative of quality. The genitive of quality is used of internal or permanent characteristics: thus *vir magnae virtutis*, where the man's inner self is the source of his greatness. The ablative of quality, used for external or transitory qualities, is not connected with the category of "source," but is one of the "with functions." Thus *puella eximia forma* becomes a "girl with exceptional beauty" because the beauty is an added or transitory thing.

The tricky ablative absolute construction also falls neatly within the "with function." Thus *urbe capta Aeneas fugit* becomes "With the city captured (or more fluently: 'with the capture of the city'), Aeneas fled," thereby preserving in the English the same indefinite meaning which the absolute has in the Latin. For whatever type of subordinate clause you choose to make out of *urbe capta*, you are open to attack! For the Latin gives you no subordinating conjunction.

D. Herbert Abel

Loyola University of Chicago

## Breviora

### Deaths among Classicists, I

Charles McCoy Baker died in Moorefield, West Virginia, on August 30, 1955, at the age of eighty-one years. A distinguished teacher and scholar, Mr. Baker had retired in 1947, after heading the department of Latin at John Burroughs School, Saint Louis County, for twenty-two years.

He had previously taught at the Horace Mann and Nichols Schools. He was co-author of *High School Course in Latin Composition*, a text still employed at John Burroughs, of which institution he served also for many years as principal of the senior school.

Richard MacGilvay Dawkins, emeritus Bywater and Sotheby Professor of Byzantine and Modern Greek at Oxford University, died on May 4, 1955. His long career had brought him to the age of eighty-three years.

Thomas J. Dumbabin, Reader in Classical Archaeology at Oxford, and Fellow of All Souls College, died at Oxford on March 31, 1955, at the early age of forty-three years. His eventful career included service in Crete, 1942-1945, as a British officer aiding local resistance to the German occupation. His labors in scholarship were particularly concerned with Greece and Greeks of the early and archaic periods.

Frank Hamilton Fowler, first professor of classics at the University of Arizona, and professor emeritus since 1937, died in Tucson, on January 28, 1955, at the age of eighty-eight years. Professor G. D. Percy, present head of the department, includes the following: "Though specializing in linguistics and publishing largely in the field of Latin grammar, in his later years Professor Fowler turned more and more to the Humanities; and he was largely instrumental in establishing the general program in that area at Arizona. He taught also for considerable periods at Lombard College and Utah."

Alexander David Fraser, long associated as professor at the University of Virginia, in the department of classics, division of classical history and antiquities, died very unexpectedly on August 1, 1955, while on a visit to his sisters in his old home, Pictou, Nova Scotia. Mr. Fraser has been a contributor to THE CLASSICAL BULLETIN, as one outlet for his extensive scholarly work. In the words of Mrs. Fraser, "Characteristically, with a book in his hand, he went to sleep and never awakened."

Philip Sheridan Miller, life member (since 1933) of the American Philological Association, and professor of classical languages at Lincoln University (Pennsylvania), died on June 7, 1955, at the age of fifty-eight years. Professor Miller's services at Lincoln University had included also a period of office as dean of the College of Liberal Arts.

Antonio Minto, distinguished Etruscan scholar, died in Florence, on August 22, 1954, at the age of seventy-three years. Among his many achievements were his organization of the National Etruscan Convention, the International Congress of Etruscan Studies, and the National Institute of Italian and Etruscan Studies, and his editorship of the journal *Studi Etruschi*. He had retired in 1951 as superintendent in Florence of Antiquities of Etruria. His publications and contributions to learned periodicals were numerous.

Bartolomeo Nogara died on June 19, 1954, at the age of eighty-six years. Over a long span of time he was associated with the Pontifical Monuments and Galleries in the Vatican—first as coadjutor to the director (1911) and then as director general (1920). Rated as the leading living authority on the Vatican and a distinguished student in Etruscology, he was honored on his seventieth birthday with a volume, *Scritti in onore di Bartolomeo Nogara*, including his biography to that date (1937) and his writings. He continued his contributions thereafter, one of the more recent results being his *Art Treasures of the Vatican* (Bergamo and New York 1951).

Biagio Pace, according to an Associated Press dispatch of September 28, 1955, from Ragusa, Sicily, died unexpectedly the preceding night at nearby Comiso, where he had been born sixty-five years previously. He had worked especially in the field of ancient Sicily and Sicilian civilization, and had attained wide renown in archaeological circles. He was a member of the Pontifical Academy of Sciences.

Joseph R. Taylor, professor emeritus of Greek at Boston University, died on August 13, 1955, bringing to a close a long life of ninety-eight years.

Ralph E. Himstead died on June 9, 1955, at the age of sixty-two years. Though not professionally a classicist, he was known to great numbers in the fields of classical philology and archaeology, as well as to many more in all the other disciplines of higher education, through his long and zealous career as general secretary of the American Association of University Professors, and editor of *The Bulletin* of that organization. He displayed a great friendliness towards the classical tradition, a deep sympathy with its aims, and a readiness to commit to the printed page many articles of classical and generally humanistic content.

### Meetings of Classical Interest, I

*Greek and Latin Plays:* The interesting tradition of reviving the classical drama continues vigorously. Among the various occurrences was a presentation of Euripides' *Hippolytus* at Randolph-Macon College, Lynchburg, Virginia, on May 14, 1955, under the direction of Fordyce W. Mitchel, associate professor of Greek, who thereby carried on the sequence of annual Greek plays begun forty-six years ago by his now retired predecessor, Mabel K. Whiteside. It has been additionally announced from Randolph-Macon that Howard Mitchell, director of the National Symphony Orchestra of Washington, D. C., would direct members of his group in supplying the background music for the 35-millimeter sound and color film of Aeschylus' *Oresteia*, produced at the college in the summer of 1954. From Roman drama is reported a presentation of Plautus' *Captivi* by students of the Jesuit Novitiate of Saint Isaac Jogues, Wernersville, Pennsylvania, on September 17, 1955, as part of the celebration commemorating the silver anniversary of the foundation of the institution.

From mediaeval drama is the presentation in English translation of Hroswitha's *Sapientia* and *Dulcinius*, on January 15, 1955, in the Lydia Mendelssohn Theatre of the University of Michigan, as designed and directed by Sister Mary Marguerite, R.S.M., with students from Mercy College (Detroit) and some other residents of Detroit.

June 4, 1955: The Ninth Annual Meeting of the *Classical Association of Canada* was held at University College, Toronto, with President Maurice Lebel in the chair. The incumbent, Maurice Lebel, was reelected president; vice-presidents are Sir H. Idris Bell, R. J. Getty, J. F. Leddy, and M. F. McGregor; continuing as secretary-treasurer is C. H. Stern, and as editor of the *Phoenix* Mary E. White.

October 8, 1955: Twenty-seventh Meeting of the *Teachers of Classics in New England*, in the house of the Signet Society, Cambridge, Massachusetts. The next meeting is pro-

jected for January 15, 1956; the third for the academic year is planned to be with the Fiftieth Meeting of The Classical Association of New England.

October 29, 1955: Fall Meeting of the *Catholic Classical Association of Greater New York*, in conjunction with the *New York Classical Club*, in Keating Hall, Fordham University, The Bronx, at 8:30 P. M., following a luncheon at 1:00 P. M. Vice-President of the CCAGNY is John F. Reilly, Yonkers, New York; Secretary-Treasurer of the NYCC is S. A. Akielaszek, Fordham University.

November 4, 1955: Annual Meeting of the *Department of Classics*, Missouri State Teachers Association, at 12:15 P. M., Hotel Jefferson, Saint Louis. Acting program Chairman is Chauncey Edgar Finch, Saint Louis University; Chairman of the Department is Mildred Huff, Sumner High School, Saint Louis, Missouri.

November 5, 1955: A Foreign Language Conference, sponsored by the *School of Education, New York University*, will deal with the theme "The Teaching of Foreign Languages in Europe: Implications for American Teachers." Conference chairman will be Christian O. Arndt, chairman of the department of foreign languages and literatures at the sponsoring institution.

November 11-13, 1955: The Fifth Annual Conference of the *Adult Education Association of the U. S. A.*, dealing with the theme "The Role of Adult Education in the Development of the Community," in Saint Louis, Missouri, at Hotel Jefferson. Classicists will see the great possibilities of their field in adult education work. Conference administrator is Phillip E. Frandson, 743 North Wabash Avenue, Chicago, Illinois; President of the Association is Paul L. Esert, of Teachers College, Columbia University.

November 12, 1955: Fall Meeting of the *New Jersey Classical Association*, Garden Room, Haddon Hall, Atlantic City. President of the Association is C. Eileen Donoghue, Bloomfield High School, Bloomfield, New Jersey.

November 26, 1955: Autumn Meeting of *The Classical Association of the Atlantic States*, Music Room, Chalfonte-Haddon Hall, Atlantic City, New Jersey, at 10:00 A. M. Secretary-Treasurer of the Association is F. Gordon Stockin, Houghton College, Houghton, New York.

December 28-30, 1955: Eighty-seventh Annual Meeting of the *American Philological Association*, in conjunction with the Fifty-seventh General Meeting of the *Archaeological Institute of America*, at the Morrison Hotel, Chicago, Illinois. Secretary-Treasurer of the APA is Paul L. MacKendrick, University of Wisconsin; General Secretary of the AIA is Paul Boulter, University of Cincinnati Library, Cincinnati, Ohio.

December 29-31, 1955: Annual Meeting of the *Linguistic Society of America*, at the Palmer House, Chicago, Illinois. The afternoon session on the first day will be held jointly with the Modern Language Association of America, for discussion of the Foreign Language Program of the latter organization. Secretary-Treasurer of the Society is Archibald A. Hill, University of Texas, Austin, Texas.

### Pliny, *Epistulae* 10.89

The first four printed editions of this letter (Avantius 1502, Beroaldus 1503, Catanaeus 1506, Aldus 1508) preserve the text of the only two manuscripts available to their editors and agree in the punctuation of it. The two manuscripts, which are no longer extant, had a common source. The printed text, our only source, was as follows: *Opto, domine, et hunc natalem et plurimos alios quam felicissimos agas aeternaque laude florentem virtutis tuae gloriam: quam incolumis et fortis aliis super alia operibus augebis.*

The conjunction *-que*, with the comma or its equivalent after *gloriam* and the *quam* which serves as the object of *augebis*, separates *aeterna laude florentem virtutis tuae gloriam* from *augebis*, and the words hardly give meaning with *agas*; *augebis*, moreover, makes the last clause express a prophecy rather than the *pia optatio* which must have been in the mind of Pliny; he was praying for the good health of the emperor and the success of his unselfish objectives, not prophesying these things.

Catanaeus, in his second edition (1518), with a sympathetic understanding of Pliny, sought to meet these objections by removing the comma after *gloriam*, substituting a correlative *et* for *quam*, and changing *augebis* to *augeas*. An editor's proper privilege never extends so far as to permit such a rewriting of the manuscript text.

The following seems to me to give the correct text and its probable history. The original text was as follows: *Opto,*

*domine, et hunc natalem et plurimos alios quam felicissimos agas et aeterna laude florentem virtutis tuae gloriam incolumis et fortis aliis super alia operibus augeas.* This may be translated as follows: "May this birthday, my lord, and many more to come, find you enjoying Fortuna's richest blessings, and may you in unbroken health and strength go on from achievement to achievement, ever increasing the undimmed glory of your good life with praise that will never die."

It was accidentally lost or purposely omitted from the continuous text *AGASETETERNA*. This left the two clauses without a connective and a later editor supplied *-que*, which began the editorial obscurement of the text. The cementing force of *-que*, which usually unites two connected elements into a single unit, brought the italicized words under the control of *agas* and led to the comma after *gloriam* and the addition of *quam* to serve as the new object of *augebis*, which to the editor seemed to suit the context better than *augeas*.

Keil (1870) almost solved the textual difficulty here. Schuster (1933, 1952) accepts the three emendations of Catanaeus, while Durry (1947) compromises by accepting the first two but keeping the prophetic *augebis* of the early editor. From the original editorial addition of *-que* to the revised edition of Schuster, a period of at least 1500 years, all attempted emendations have been based solely upon logical considerations rather than upon a careful analysis of the manuscript tradition. This method of emending has been the most prolific source of the perversion of the text in Pliny's *Letters*.

Indiana University

Selatie E. Stout

### Continuance of Woodrow Wilson Fellowship Program

Robert F. Goheen, national director of the Woodrow Wilson Fellowship Program, South Reunion Hall, Princeton, New Jersey, announces under date of June 15, 1955, that in the "past year 159 Fellowships were awarded from among 1522 nominations, received from faculty members at 437 institutions. These Fellows came from 109 different colleges and universities; they will be attending 38 graduate schools; their fields of study cover 19 departments."

These fellowships are awarded on invitation only, upon nomination by members of the academic profession. They expect high qualities of academic ability and character in the nominees, who normally are from graduating classes of persons looking to the bachelor's degree and therefore not as yet formally in graduate work. Fellowships are awarded for one year, normally for resident graduate study at a graduate school of the nominee's choice in the United States or Canada, in the fields of the humanities or social sciences. The stipend varies with circumstances, but an unmarried nominee may expect basically \$1,250 plus tuition.

The intent of the program is to provide qualified young men and women with the opportunity "to undertake a year of advanced study in a graduate school of their choice and thus to determine whether they wish to enter the profession of teaching and scholarship." Twelve regional committees carry on the work of recruitment; or nominations may be sent immediately to the national director. The closing date for nominations is November 14, 1955.

### Certamen Capitolinum VII

Institutum Romanis studiis provehendis, auspiciis Summi litterarum artiumque apud Italos Curatore et Romanae civitatis Magistro, ad novum prosae Latinae orationis certamen omnes omnium gentium Latini sermonis studiosos homines invitat, sperans fore ut e nobilissimorum ingeniorum concertatione aliquid emicet, quod Quiritium maiestate facundiae sit dignum.

Certaminis praemium, quod Urbis praemium nuncupatur, erit argenteum sigillum, lupam Capitolinam imitatum, honorificentissimum Romanae civitatis munus, in basi victoriam nomen atque annum et diem certaminis praeferebat. Huius sigillo Summus litterarum artiumque liberalium Curator ducenta denariorum Italicoorum milia ex aerario adici iussit.

Ceteri petitores, qui digni habiti sint, laude ornabuntur. Ex iis autem qui victori proximus de agone discesserit, argenteo nummo decorabitur, a civitate Romana item donabitur qui in antica parte Capitoli imaginem, in aversa litterati viri nomen atque annum diemque certaminis exhibebit. Huius quoque muneri Summus litterarum artiumque liberalium Co-



centum milia denariorum Italicorum ex aerario iussit addi.

Exitum certaminis a. d. xi Kal. Mai. a. MDCCCCLVI, die Urbis natali, in aedibus Capitolinis, Romanae civitatis Magister in oratione, quam de more habiturus est, renuntiavit.

Scripta quae praemio ornabuntur typis excudenda, si visum erit, curabit Institutum Romanis studiis provehendis, ac proinde post annum tantum integrum erit auctoribus eadem in lucem edere.

### Leges Certaminis

i) Fictis fabellis, commentariolis historicis, disputationibus philologis, denique omni prosae eloquentiae genere certare licet: sed praestantium ingeniorum nova experimenta Capitolinum certamen requirit. Scripta quibus petitores certabant ne puerorum gymnasiis sint destinata ne mille et quingentis verbis breviora ne prius in lucem edita ne alio praemio ornata neve laude, neve ex alio sermone sint conversata.

ii) Quinque libellorum suorum exemplaria vel machinula scriptoria perspicue exarata vel typis excusa et tabellariorum diligentiae commendata mittant scriptores aemuli ad Istituto di Studi Romani—Ufficio Latino—Piazza dei Cavalieri di Malta n. 2—Roma ante Kal. Februarias proximi anni non suo tamen distincta nomine ne in integumento quidem, quo conclusa sunt, sed sententia munita, quae eadem inscripta sit scidulae obsignatae, nomen domiciliumque scriptoris exhibenti.

iii) Quinque viri iudices erunt a Summo litterarum artiumque liberalium Curatore et a civitatis Romanae Magistro et a Praeside Instituti nostri delecti. Hi post iudicium scidulas resignabunt, quae easdem quas scripta probata sententias praefert. Scripta non probata, si repetita, reddentur: sin minus una cum scidulis obsignatis, tertio exacto mense post iudicium publicatum, delebuntur igne.

D. Roma Kal. Mai. a. MDCCCCLV ab U. c. MMDCCVII.

Quintus Tosatti

Praeses Instituti,  
Romanis Studiis Provehendis

### Book Reviews

Stewart C. Easton, *The Heritage of the Past*. New York, Rinehart & Company, Inc., 1955. Pp. xx, 795. \$6.00.

The title page indicates the coverage of this book: "From the Earliest Times to the Close of the Middle Ages." After some pages on prehistory, Mr. Easton presents a pleasant yet well-broken-down narrative of the Middle East in ancient times, adding a substantial section on the Far East. Two hundred pages on the various aspects of Greece and Rome complete the first half of the book.

With the barbarian invasions, Byzantium, and the Muslim Empire, the author makes the transition to the Middle Ages. Here we find outlined in the customary way the political, social, religious, cultural, and economic history of that thousand years. At the end, the national development of England, France, and Spain are detailed.

The religious interpretations of the author will not be acceptable to all. Catholic Christians do not hold that Saint Paul is the real founder of Christianity. Neither do they hear him teach that faith without good works is sufficient for salvation. For them baptism is not merely a symbolic washing away of the sins of the converts nor is man saved by an inner act without reception into the Church (p. 400). And it is not correct to state that Saint Augustine following Saint Paul says that the human will is not free (p. 407).

The physical make-up of the book is excellent. The illustrations are numerous and were presented in the two-column text, and the maps are simple and well adapted to clarify the matter under consideration. Especially commendable and helpful to the student are the eighteen chronological charts that appear at the head of the respective chapters in the book.

The critical bibliographies wisely confined to a few books and placed at strategic places are praiseworthy. But one might fairly expect that Catholic authorities would be given a more generous hearing on their Church during that thousand years and more in the Church of Rome was the Christian Church. That Powicke's unenlightened essay on the Christian Church in *The Legacy of the Middle Ages* should be called "a fine study" (p. 591) is deplorable, and it is a great understatement to say that Lea's views on the Inquisition are only "perhaps" anticlerical.

Clarence A. Herbst, S.J.

Saint Stanislaus Seminary,  
Florissant, Missouri

C. A. Robinson, *The History of Alexander the Great: Vol. I, Part 1, An Index to the Extant Historians; Part II, The Fragments* (Brown University Studies, Vol. 16). Providence, Brown University, 1953. Pp. xx, 276. \$7.00.

Professor Robinson's primary aim is to awaken interest in the examination and interpretation of the literary texts relative to Alexander as they are discovered in the fragments, which include the primary accounts of Eumenes, Diodorus, Callisthenes, Aristobulus, and Ptolemy, and in the secondary historical accounts of Arrian, Diodorus, Justin, Curtius, and Plutarch. The fragments, drawn from Jacoby's *FGH*, Part II B (Berlin 1929), appear in translation by various hands, including the editor's. Greekless readers must be particularly grateful for this generous unveiling of relevant information.

To facilitate a comprehensive study of the ancient accounts of Alexander, Robinson has registered Alexander's itinerary from Ilium to Babylon. In this respect, the present volume forms a supplement to Robinson's earlier *The Ephemerides of Alexander's Expedition* (Providence 1932). Under the place-names, either visited or mentioned in Alexander's momentous travels, every fact or opinion recorded by the five extant historians in connection with the sites has been listed by careful, however subjective, reference to fifty-eight classifications or categories. These categories enable the student to discover, with minimum effort, existing evidence on such controversial topics as Alexander's character; his far-reaching plans and explorations; his deification; his public works; his "orientalizing." Robinson proposes to analyse and comment on these categories and the fragments in a subsequent volume.

The Index and the translated Fragments will unquestionably prove of immense service to all except the most professional researchers; in addition, they supply an indispensable check on statements already in print. Ancient historians are indebted to Robinson for this important addition to the growing literature on Alexander.

Alexander G. McKay

The University of Western Ontario

Revelo Pendleton Oliver (ed.), *Niccolò Perotti's Version of the Enchiridion of Epictetus: With an Introduction and a List of Perotti's Writings*. Urbana, University of Illinois Press, 1954. Pp. ix, 166. \$4.00.

The Latin translation of Epictetus' *Enchiridion* of Stoic moral principles made by Niccolò Perotti (1429-1480) here appears in print for the first time since it was completed, probably in 1450. The present volume thus supplies a work hitherto entirely missing in our canon of available Renaissance texts. The editor, associate professor of Spanish and Italian at the University of Illinois, leaves nothing to be desired in text or notes (which are in Latin), and in a carefully worked out introduction (in English) treating Perotti's background and comparing the difference between Perotti's good, but still relatively primitive, Renaissance Latin and the later translation by the more sensitive Politian.

Professor Oliver is less enthusiastic about Epictetus' *Enchiridion* itself than about Perotti's translation. The Stoicism of the Phrygian freedman, compiled in this manual by a follower, is a philosophy of insecurity, we are told, "a doctrine of freedom devised by a slave . . . whereby the man who feels that his property and person are irremediably insecure may retreat into the inextinguishable citadel of his own consciousness." This may not be the only reading one can give Epictetus; but, in so far as it represents what he stands for, it makes his popularity no less interesting. For this work was strangely congenial to many Renaissance educators, and went through countless editions as a textbook, often bound together with Cebes' *Tabula*. Its bluntly simplistic approach to life undoubtedly did much to recommend it as a textbook—"There are two kinds of existing things," Epictetus confidently begins, "those inside us and those outside us." This is the sort of philosophy around which a twelve-year-old can weave the "themes" required of him. Politian's translation, not Perotti's, is the one found in the textbooks, and perhaps for this reason, Mr. Oliver's introduction does not treat the schoolroom tradition. But the schoolroom is undoubtedly what kept Epictetus' manual alive in Western civilization, where it has its effect on Shakespeare and his contemporaries and successors, and indirectly on us as well.

Mr. Oliver's English style is itself interesting in its own right. He cultivates the lapidary manner bearing many of the marks of late baroque which the eighteenth, nineteenth, and early twentieth centuries used to represent in English what classical Latin meant to them. At times almost comically



sedate (and thus capable of lending itself to exquisite irony), this manner can be nevertheless, among other things, unquestionably incisive.

Saint Louis University

Walter J. Ong, S.J.

Mary E. White, editor, *Studies in Honour of Gilbert Norwood*. Toronto, University of Toronto Press (*The Phoenix*, Supplementary Volume 1), 1952. Pp. xvii, 278. \$5.00.

This volume was dedicated to Professor Norwood, since deceased, on the occasion of his seventieth birthday and his retirement from the directorship of classical studies in University College, Toronto. It contains a long list of his published writings and thirty essays by well-known scholars of the English-speaking world. The various articles are chiefly concerned with literary problems, though a number treat of historical and religious matters as well. Leonard Woodbury finds in the "seal" of Theognis the poet's conviction that his name through his work will receive undying fame. W. B. Stanford analyses a puzzling use of "white" in Pindar. E. R. Dodds re-edits a papyrus fragment which has been regarded as a description of magical powers and interprets it as a portion of a Greek novel. H. J. Rose discusses the problem of translating metaphors. Robert J. Getty brings up for consideration the astrological implications of Vergil's *Liber et Alma Ceres*. There are numerous other essays of the same general character which professional classicists will enjoy, but which may prove to have been written in too rarefied an atmosphere for the general public. The volume also includes a number of more ambitious projects, and with the conclusions of three of these there probably will be some disagreement.

G. M. A. Grube explains the immorality of the Homeric gods by maintaining that before Homer the gods "must have been thought of as powers, spirits, animal or human persons in a general way, but the clear anthropomorphism which endowed the gods with human form, mind, and personality was almost certainly elaborated by the epic poets themselves. While this process was going on . . . there can have been for some time no thought that the conduct of the gods had any moral or religious significance" (p. 6). This explanation implies an evolutionary process with regard to the acquiring of a knowledge of the Supreme Being, beginning with a kind of early dynamism or animism. It is a theory which is not substantiated by a thorough study of the beliefs of contemporary primitives.

T. H. Robinson finds that "there was some connection between 'prophecy' as understood in the monarchical period of Israel's history and certain religious phenomena which we find in the Graeco-Roman world" (p. 231).

A common origin for the two prophetic traditions is traced to Asia Minor. The extrinsic dependence of Judaism and Christianity on external cultural influences is frequently a problem for the exegete. Robinson has pointed up some interesting parallels between the ecstatic prophets of the Israelites and their Canaanite predecessors and with the seers of Greece and Rome, but I am not sure that he has sufficiently maintained the essential difference between the actual revelation made to the Jews and the hallucinations of the other ancient religions.

E. A. Havelock does not believe that Socrates was condemned for being a "militant free-thinker" or for being the "leader of a conventicle devoted to beliefs and practices which were unofficial and unorthodox" (p. 95). The insistence which Plato in the *Apologia* has placed upon the second part of the twofold indictment has been misleading. Socrates was really one of the leaders of the sophistic movement which tried "to supplant family group associations by streamlined methods of instruction and indoctrination" (p. 102). Moreover, their "radical programme, whether or not its promoters chose to underline the fact, could only be found in a state university system large enough to accommodate the citizen body" (p. 104). In order to carry his point, Havelock must maintain that "previous trials for impiety . . . can all be referred to motives of political prejudice or interest" (p. 95). The ephobic oath at Athens contained a promise to honor the ancestral gods, and I do not think that the Athenians regarded it so lightly as never to have prosecuted an individual for its non-observance. At least in this particular matter *errore mehercule malo cum Platone . . . quam cum istis vera sentire* (Cic. Tusc. 1.39).

M. Joseph Costelloe, S.J.

Saint Stanislaus Seminary,  
Florissant, Missouri

## Materials Available

through the Office of  
The Classical Bulletin

Richard E. Arnold, S.J., Editor

### CLASSICAL ESSAYS PRESENTED TO JAMES A. KLEIST, S.J.

Containing an INTRODUCTION by the Editor, with articles by Walter R. Agard, William H. Alexander, Norman J. DeWitt, Charles C. Mierow, Clyde Murley, John A. Scott, Francis A. Sullivan, S.J.

Each, \$2.50

Thomas P. Byrne, S.J.

### FACETE DICTUM: A LATIN READER WITH A DASH OF HUMOR

Light-hearted reading for those with a year and a half or more of systematic training in Latin.

Each, \$1.00

### General Index

#### TWO VOLUMES 1-25 OF THE CLASSICAL BULLETIN (1924-1949)

Each, 50c

William R. Hennes, S.J., and Richard E. Arnold, S.J.

### IRIS: A READING LIST OF ARTICLES SELECTED FROM CLASSICAL PERIODICALS

Chosen from nine periodicals from the beginning of each until August 1, 1941.

Each, \$1.50

Leo M. Kaiser

### T. MACCIUS PLAUTUS, THE CAPTIVES: EDITED WITH INTRODUCTION, NOTES, AND VOCABULARY

Intended for rapid reading in lower classes

Each, \$1.25

William C. Korfmacher

### OTHLONI LIBELLUS PROVERBIORUM

Critical and annotated edition of an eleventh-century proverb collection.

Each, \$2.00

O. J. Kuhnmuensch, S.J.

### AIDS FOR THE RHYTHMIC READING OF VERGIL

#### SOME AIDS TO LATIN

Each, 5c; in lots of 12 or more, each, 4c

Raymond V. Schoder, S.J.

### CLASSICAL BOOKS FOR HIGH SCHOOL NEEDS

Each, 5c; in lots of 12 or more, each, 4c

### Sense-Line Texts . . .

Cicero, IN CATILINAM ORATIO PRIMA  
(Peterson)

Cicero, IN CATILINAM ORATIO TERTIA  
(Bachhuber)

Cicero, IN CATILINAM ORATIO QUARTA  
(Giunta)

Cicero, PRO ARCHIA (Peterson)

Each, 25c; in lots of 12 or more, each 20c

Address:

## The Classical Bulletin

3647 West Pine Boulevard

Saint Louis 8, Missouri

All items are sent plus postage

olumes

letin

with  
Alex-  
erow,  
Sulli-  
\$2.50

TH A

r and  
Latin.  
\$1.00

, 50c

, S.J.

S  
nning  
\$1.50

s  
\$1.35

venth-  
\$2.00

ch, 4c

ch, 4c

ch 20c